Hon'ble Justice R. J. Shah [Retd.] Fee/Admission (Medical) Committee, Behind Polytechnic, Near Five Bungalow, Gulbai Tekara, Ahmedabad-15

No.JRJS/ 367 /2007

Date: 27/06/2007

To, The Dean, Kesar SAL Medical College, Ahmedabad

Sub :- Fee Fixation for the years 2006-07, 2007-08, 2008-09

Under the directions from the High Court of Gujarat in judgements passed by the Honourable Justice Shri D. A. Mehta on 7th December, 2006 while hearing various Special Civil Applications filed by the petitioner colleges as well as under similar order passed in the SCA No. 17856 and 17857, the Committee has considered your proposal for fee structure afresh.

The order passed by the Committee at its meeting held on 20th June, 2007 is enclosed herewith along with detailed working in support of the same.

In case you need any clarification or need to make any submission/provide further information, you may approach the Committee by Saturday, 7th July 2007.

For Justice R. J. Shah [Retd.] Fee committee (Medical)

MEMBER SECRETARY

College: Kesar SAL Medical College, Ahmedabad

As per directions of the Hon'ble Supreme Court in the case of Islamic Academic Education & another v/s State of Karnataka & Others on 14th August 2003, the Government of Gujarat has set up a Committee vide GR No. SCF/2003/CC-59/S dated 26th December 2003, under the Chairmanship of Justice (Retd.) Shri R.J. Shah (hereinafter called "The Committee") to give effect of the judgement in TMA Pai's case.

Background:

- As per the directions in the said judgement, each educational institution must place before this Committee well in advance of the academic year its proposed fee structure. Along with the proposed fee structure, all documents and Books of Accounts must also be produced before the Committee for their scrutiny. The Committee shall then decide whether the fees proposed by the institute are not profiteering or charging capitation fee. <u>The Committee will be at liberty to approve the submitted fee structure or to</u> <u>propose some other which can be charged by the institute</u>. The fee fixed by the Committee shall be binding for a period of 3 years, at the end of which the institute would be at liberty to apply for a revision.
- Accordingly the Committee had approved for the first time in June 2004, the fee structure of all the Medical Colleges within the State of Gujarat for the academic years 2003-04, 2004-05 and 2005-06. As per the directions in the said judgement, a revision in the fee structure is due for a further period of 3 years from 2006-07 to 2008-09.

pproach and Methodology:

In the month of December 2005, the Committee, has requested all the unaided institutions imparting professional education in medical and allied sciences in the State of Gujarat to submit their proposed fee structure for scrutiny of the Committee, along with the details as per the detailed questionnaire submitted to each of the institutes.

- The data was then analyzed to arrive at the broad view of the facilities, infra-structure, capital investments made by the college in last 3 years, plans for development on hand and for future, compliance of the requirements concerning the staff etc.
- This was followed by personal visit to all the colleges by the Committee consisting of the member of the fee committee, an eminent Doctor and a member of the team of Chartered Accountants, to verify the facilities and infra-structure, adequacy of staff and to have clarifications and further information on some of the issues arising out of the analysis of the data.
 - During the visit, the Committee held discussions with a few of the students and staff in private to get their feedback on specific issues concerning fees, facilities, quality of education etc. The committee also visited the affiliated hospitals to check for the quality of service and care provided to the patients.

The committee also gave a public hearing to the students, parents association as well as the management of the colleges on 11th and 12th May 2006.

Guiding principles:

In discharging its functions, the Committee has kept in mind following observations contained in the said judgement of Islamic Academy, which have been reaffirmed recently in the case of P.A. Inamdar & Others v/s State of Maharashtra & Others, on August 12, 2005.

- (a) So far as the question of fee fixation is concerned, the judgement has categorically emphasized that there can be no fixing of rigid fee structure by the Government. Each institute must have the freedom to fix its own fee structure taking into consideration the need to generate funds to run the institution and to provide facilities necessary for the benefit of the students.
- (b) They must be able to generate surplus which must be used for the betterment and growth of the educational institution. Similar observations in the TMA Pai case provides for reasonable surplus for furtherance of education. (Para 69).
- (c) The decision on the fee to be charged must necessarily be left to the private educational institutions who are not depending on the funds from the Government.
- (d) Each institute will be entitled to have its own fee structure. The fee structure for each institute must be fixed keeping in mind the infra-structure and facilities available, investments made, salary paid to the teaching and other staff, future plans for expansion and/or betterment of the institute etc.
- (e) There can be no profiteering and capitation fee cannot be charged.

Issues arising and responses:

During the exercise for revision of the fees, two major issues came up for consideration before the committee:

- (a) Whether the proposed fee structure should be applicable to all the students on roll as of the applicable date or should be applicable to new batch of students to be enrolled from the year 2006-07 ?
- (b) Application of accepted accounting and costing principles and practices for treatment of cost of running a free bed hospital and provision for reasonable surplus for betterment and growth.

he Committee's views are as under :

(a) Application of revision in the fee structure.

- Since the judgment in Islamic Academy provides for revision of fee every 3 years, it implies that the fees can be revised based on the cost escalation and provision of additional facilities and infrastructure at regular interval of course not earlier than 3 years, if the concerned institution has applied for a revision.
- In any exercise of price fixation which is based on cost, the revision is applicable to all the beneficiaries for whom the cost is being incurred. In the case of Medical colleges, for instance the fees are fixed based on normal recurring cost of revenue nature which is directly related to education. Since this cost is subject to inflation, a periodic revision becomes necessary, and when the cost is revised, it should be applicable to all the beneficiaries on a given date.

- In case a contrary view is taken to apply the revised fee structure only to the new batch, the fee structure would be enormously high as only one batch of the students will be subjected to bear the additional cost that is being incurred for 4½ batches at any given point of time. This will put the new students in a disadvantageous position.
- As such the Committee thought it just and fair to apply the proposed fee structure to all the students on roll during the period of 3 years from 2006-07 to 2008-09 irrespective of the year in which they were enrolled. In addition, the Committee has also borne in mind the directive of the Supreme Court in T.M.A. Pai's case that there cannot be any cross subsidization of fee in any institution.

(b) Treatment of Hospital Cost:

- In the matter of treatment of hospital cost, the Committee has appreciated the need to have a teaching hospital as prescribed by MCI as a precondition to set up a Medical college. However, in the views of the Committee, it is unfair to recover the entire deficit of running the hospital from the students only. In the earlier exercise also, the Committee has suggested sharing of hospital cost between medical care and medical education.
- This year one of the private medical colleges has undertaken a costing exercise from a reputed firm, namely S.B. Billimoria & Company, Chartered Accountants, in support of their proposal for the revision in the fee structure. The said report contains analysis of total cost of medical education which has been overseen by Shri Y.H. Malegam.
- Shri Malegam is one of the most respected and most experienced Chartered Accountant in the country today and a celebrity of international repute. Past President of the Institute of Chartered Accountants of India, Shri Malegam is a Director on the Board of Reserve Bank of India and has chaired several high level committees appointed by the Central Government, SEBI, RBI, ICAI and other bodies in the field of accounts, finance, taxation and corporate governance.
- The Committee has studied the said Billimoria report in detail and found merit in the treatment of some of the costs related to education in general and treatment of hospital cost in particular. As such the Committee has followed the same rationale for all the medical colleges so far as treatment of hospital cost is concerned, which is summarized as under :
 - Excluding the cost of medicine, the expenses related to treatment and blood bank expenses which can be considered as variable expenses specific to patients, the remaining items can be considered as fixed expenses arising from the maintenance of the teaching hospital.
 - For the purposes of this exercise, we have assumed that <u>this fixed cost</u> <u>may fairly be allocated in equal proportion between the cost of medical</u> <u>care and the cost of medical education.</u>
 - Since on an average students spend almost 50% of their time in the hospital, only 50% of hospital expenditure is allocated to medical education.

- Like wise, since the teaching staff spent almost 50% time in the hospital, we have considered that 50% of the cost of manpower (teaching) can be treated as part of cost of medical care.
- The cost of medical education may therefore be considered as the direct cost of medical education (as reduced by manpower (teaching) cost allocated to medical care) plus the share of medical care allocated to medical education.
- The sharing of hospital cost does not arise where the educational institution has a tie up with any other hospital to take their services at a fixed price per student. In such case, the committee has allowed actual amount paid per student to such hospital in determination of the fee structure.

(c) Reasonable Surplus:

- So far as the provision for development and reasonable surplus is concerned, the Committee has appreciated the need for the same. The committee has allowed the same through depreciation allowance and development allowance.
- Though the initial investments are made through donations, the committee is seized of the fact that the replacement of the facilities over a period need to happen through collection of fees. As such the committee has considered economic depreciation as part of education cost even though it is a non cash item.
- In addition, the Committee has allowed reasonable allowance for growth and betterment in the form of development allowance based on the history of capital investments made by the institute during past 3 years and definite investment plans for growth and development projected by it for next 3 years.

Review consequent upon the order passed by the High Court of Gujarat

- 1. In accordance with the principles and processes as detailed above, the Fee Committee had announced the fee structure for 43 Private Unaided Medical, Dental, Physiotherapy and Para Medical Colleges vide its order dated 20th June 2006. Aggrieved by the order on reduction of the fees proposed by the colleges, 10 colleges (Annexure A) approached Gujarat High Court for appropriate relief. HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE D.A.MEHTA of THE HIGH COURT OF GUJARAT AT AHMEDABAD in SPECIAL CIVIL APPLICATION No. 13887 of 2006, had vide order dated 7th December 2007, quashed the fee structure and referred the matter to the Committee for taking a decision afresh. The order also provided for inviting the students of the petitioner institute at the hearing to be fixed for the petitioner.
- 2. Accordingly, the Fee Committee has given hearing to all the petitioner institutes as well as to the students of the concerned institutes in the month of January 2007.
- 3. While the Committee received number of representations, both oral and written, the issues raised were limited in number and similar in nature. The Colleges also gave their submissions in person and through their lawyers. A summary thereof has been given in **Annexure B.**

- 4. As indicated in the summary of the hearing given to the colleges, none of the colleges has resubmitted proposal for reconsideration and each one has maintained that the fee structure as originally proposed should be reconsidered. As such the Committee has reviewed the proposals in light of hearing given to the colleges as well as the students along with its earlier findings and observations.
- The Committee observes that colleges while challenging the earlier order have following major grievances.
 - The order of the fee committee has not given adequate and convincing reasons in disapproving the proposed fee structure.
 - 2. The Committee did not give them opportunity for personal hearing to justify the fee structure proposed by the college.
 - 3. The fee structure once fixed should be valid for three years and the college should not be asked to approach the committee every year.
 - The Committee has reviewed all the papers, documents, cost estimates, past performance and future projections. Based on the review, findings from the personal visits, submissions made by the students and inter college comparison, the Committee has noted as under.
 - a. All the medical and dental colleges challenging the earlier order of the Committee have proposed a steep increase in the range of 150% to 400% based merely on the projections for next three years. It is evident from the individual analysis reported to the concerned college by a separate annexure, there is a wide difference between the latest audited numbers and the cost estimates in support of the proposed fee scale.
 - b. The students have complained about deficiency in the staff strength, infrastructure, other facilities, levy of fees in different forms etc. While this is a general observation, college specific issues are listed in the individual annexure.
 - c. The Committee had visited all the colleges and had met the students and faculties independently and was made aware of such irregularities / deficiencies.
 - d. The deficiency related to the required infrastructure and staff strength has been reported in media time and again and the latest one has appeared on 15th of this month where in the MCI has cancelled medical seats in two colleges.
 - e. In light of what is stated above, the Committee has felt it proper to continue to discount the projections made by the colleges that were not based on facts and ground realities. Some of the expenses claimed by the colleges like finance cost, legal expenses, rent paid to parent trust, electricity and transport for common facilities have been excluded in full or part as explained in a separate annexure for each college referred to in paragraph (f) herein below.
 - f. In its earlier order quashed by the Court, the Committee had briefly explained the findings and observations in support of the reduced fee structure. After the review, the Committee finds it necessary to provide full analysis of the accounts, other relevant information and rationale for not accepting the proposed fee

structure. Detailed reasoning for your college for working out the base fees has been given in **Annexure C**.

- 9. The Committee had fixed the fees on yearly basis purely on the ground of fairness to the students. The Committee has seen that not many colleges have proven track record of meeting the investment projections when compared with proven track record of meeting the investment projections when compared with based solely on projections would do injustice to the students in as much as they would pay for projections that lack certainty and commitment. This approach has for the period of three years. As such the Committee now recommends a revised for the period of three years. As such the Committee now recommends and 2008-09. The fee structure that is valid for the years 2006-07, 2007-08 and 2008-09. The students would also know the amount of fees they have to pay for next three
- years.
 In fixing the fees for the period of three years as indicated above, the Committee has considered moderate increase for inflation as well as development based on has considered in light of past history of the college, compliance with statutory norms framed in light of past history of the college, growth plans on hand etc. requirements as to staff and other infrastructure, growth plans on hand etc. Accordingly, the Committee has fixed the fees for each year separately instead of a common fee for all the three years.
 - i. To ensure that the colleges do spend for the growth and development to keep pace with new and emerging trends and technologies, the Committee has thought it proper to include reasonable allowance for development as suggested above. The final fees approved include the same. This is conditional upon the assurance that college will deposit at least 5% of the approved fees in a separate account to be utilized for the development of the infrastructure, separate account to be utilized for the development of the infrastructure, separate account to be utilized for the development of the infrastructure, separate account to he utilized for the end of the year would be utilized as the facilities etc. Any unused amount at the end of the year would be utilized as conditions of the students.
 - j. So far as the applicability of the revised fee structure to the students enrolled during 2003-04, 2004-05 and 2005-06 is concerned, the Committee has made its during 2003-04, 2004-05 and 2005-06 is concerned, the Students on roll as on view clear that the revised fees are applicable to all the students on roll as on date. This stand has been upheld by the High Court in its interim order dated 20th date. This stand has been upheld by the said order reads as under.
 - i. Prima facie I am however, unable to accept the contention of learned advocate for the petitioners that the revised fee should be made applicable only to new students and students who are already studying should be spared such revision. Accepting for such a contention would should be under on fresh students. All students, therefore, will bear equal burden of revised fee.
 - k. Other issues raised during the hearing pertain to treatment of hospital cost, collection of fees and charges in different forms, demand for bank guarantee etc. The rationale behind consideration of the hospital cost has been explained in full here in above. In the matter of other issues, necessary instructions are given here under in the concluding part of the order.

I. In final analysis, the Committee recommends following fee structure.

- i. Year 2006-07 Rs. 1,60,000
- ii. Year 2007-08 Rs. 1,70,000
- iii. Year 2008-09 Rs. 1,80,000

Other conditions to apply:

- The college will not take fees for the full course at the time of admission. The fees . should be collected per semester.
- The college will not ask for any bank guarantee or security of any kind from students . or their parents.
- The college will not take any other fee, deposit, charge or advance in the name of gymkhana, computer center, internet facility laboratory, library, sports, recreation, self . development etc.
- The college will be free to fix fees for NRI students up to 15% of the intake capacity subject to intimation of the same to the Fee Committee. All additional fees from NRI students in whatever form will be utilized for the benefit of students such as from . economically weaker section of the society as per the directions given by the Supreme Court in its judgment in the case of P. A. Inamdar and Others v/s State of Maharashtra and Others.

20th June, 2007. hos

Hon'ble Justice R. J.Shah(Retd) Chairman

Bhupendra M Shah Member

Suresh Soni Member

Smt. Rita Teaotia, IAS Member Secretary

Litin Vore

Dr. Nitin Vora Member

Annexure A

List of colleges for which the Gujarat High Court had issued orders for review of the fees structure for the years 2006-07, 2007-08 and 2008-09.

1.S.B.B. Physiotherapy College, Ahmedabad

2.Sarvajenik Physiotherapy College, Surat

3.Kesarsal Medical College, Ahmedabad

4. Physiotherapy College, Anand

5.Karnavati School of Dentistry, Uvarsad

6.S.B.K.S. Medical College, Waghodia

7.K. M. Shah Dental College, Waghodia

8.K.J. Pandya Physiotherapy College, Waghodia

9.Swaminarayan Physiotherapy College, Surat

10.Ahmedabad Dental College, Ahmedabad

Annexure B.

Issues raised by the colleges are summarized as under.

- 1. The Committee has not given any written reasons hits disagreement with the fee structure proposed by the college.
- 2. The Committee must consider full cost of running the teaching bed hospital instead of allowing only part of the cost of running the hospital. The arguments advanced for the claim is that the hospital is set up and run only to comply with the requirements prescribed by the Medical Council of India for Medical Colleges and Dental Council of India for Dental Colleges.
- 3. The Colleges have maintained that the fees structure proposed at the beginning of the exercise stands and the same should be considered by the Committee. None of the concerned institutes have preferred to give a fresh proposal.
- 4. Almost all the colleges have submitted that the college will have to be closed if the fee structure as proposed is not approved by the Committee.

Issues raised by the students are summarized as under.

- 1. The fee approved by the Committee is too high and unreasonable in light of the facilities and infrastructure provided by the College.
- 2. The fees for the old students must remain the same for the entire duration of the concerned course and no change should be made for them.
- 3. The students also raised their demands for reduction of fees in light of some published figures of Rs.90,000 as cost of medical education per student.
- 4. Students have resubmitted their presentation made earlier during public hearing since in their views most of the issues raised there at remain unaddressed.
- 5. Majority of the students complained about harassment and vengeance by the college authorities for non payment of fees and other unauthorized charges and fees.
- 6. The students also complained about levy of additional fees in the name of College Deposit, Caution Deposit, Fees for use Internet, Fees for Indian Dental Association (IDA) Membership, laboratory instruments and dental materials, higher charges for issue of identity cards etc.
- 7. The colleges force to pay fees in advance for the succeeding year before enrolment for the University Examination.

- 8. Almost in each college, the students complained about the insufficiency of teaching staff, absence of regular and permanent staff, predominance of visiting faculties, and presence of ghost staff whom they have never seen on the campus or in the class rooms.
- 9. Many students voiced their concerns about charging higher fees in the name of air-conditioned class rooms, land beautification, unrelated expenses like legal fees and advertisements etc.

Annexure C:

Kesar SAL Medical College.

The college has proposed a fee of Rs 5,00,000 per student per year as against the current fee of Rs.1,30,000. This fee is proposed to be collected from all the students on roll as on the commencement of the academic year 2006-07.

As explained in the report, the Committee has analyzed the information received from the colleges as requested, visited the colleges and the hospital and had given hearing to the management.

Observations and the recommendations:

- 1. The Committee notes that most of the expenses projected for the future are abnormally high and lack justification. To cite an example, the salary cost of the teaching staff which was Rs.171 lac in 2004-05, has been projected to be Rs.826 lac for the year 2006-07 and Rs. 908 lac for the year 2007-08. While we appreciate the need to augment the teacning strength for the additional intake, we have been informed by the students that most of the faculty members are not regular, they are not in full time teaching and that many of them are seen very randomly. This observation is confirmed by the action taken by MCI as reported in newspapers on 15th June 2007.
- 2. Going through the long list of the staff members, the Committee observed that majority of them are attached to the Hospital and their entire expenditure has been claimed to be part of education. As explained in the note, the Committee has relied on the observations and recommendations made by M/s. S.B. Billimoria & Co., in their report for the treatment of cost of medical care and accordingly, the Committee has considered only 50% of the medical care cost for the purpose of education.
- 3. The College has also projected finance cost as part of the cost of education. As per the Guidelines given by the Committee and as per Generally Accepted Accounting and Costing Principles, the same has not been allowed being the finance cost.
- 4. The projection for inflation and expansion has an element of uncertainty and contingency. While it is true that the fee fixed now is valid for a period of three years, it is not fair to accept the projections in its entirety at the beginning of the period of 3 years and work out the fees accordingly. The matching principle of accounting expects that the cost either precedes revenue or co-exists with revenue. Revenue cannot precede cost and as such fees should not be permitted to be recovered solely on cost projections. A balance of timing needs to be struck. As such the Committee recommends charging for inflation and development at the end of each year.

Str No. Particulars Concursion Concursion <thconcursion< th=""> Concursion Concursion</thconcursion<>		COST OF MEDICAL EDUCATION		10	1000				
Salary to start Antoning	Sr. No.	Particulars	2004-	-05	2005	06	9	2007-	08
Salary to staff Salary to			Allioulit	AITIOUTIL	Amount	Amount	-	Amount	Amount
Less: 30% of salary cost (Refer Note 1) 11868713 1288 190.56 201347 Less: 50% of recast salary added to hospital cost 8916038 8110035 190.55 285.38 40766 Inspection Fees MCI Inspection Fees 282.266 96.61 142.69 142.69 203333 Inspection Fees MCI Inspection Fees 200000 112.56 112.66 203343 Annal Day Contract Exp 112200 500 0 400 203 Contrement Fees 112200 112.56 173.51 203 Contrement Fees 112200 100.00 100.00 100.00 Subscription Exp 100.00 100.00 100.00 203 Contenence Exp 2030443 3173 31735 217351 217351 Subscription Exp 116.86 116.86 17351 217 Contrement Exp 203040 20000 100.00 100.00 Table Direct Education Cost 2723220 115.26 203.76 217 Table Direct Education Cost 2460443 3173 213 213 213 Cost April Direct Education Cost 2460443 317 213 214 Cost Apri Apelcare cost 55.67 116.86		Salary to staff	29716782	2	222 04		-	670 40	
40% of recast salary added to hospital cost 10000 10 12.6 8.1 12.6 10.1 <td< td=""><td></td><td>I pece : 40% of calany cost / Defer Nate 1)</td><td>110001107</td><td></td><td>10.220</td><td></td><td>470.00</td><td>0/9.42</td><td></td></td<>		I pece : 40% of calany cost / Defer Nate 1)	110001107		10.220		470.00	0/9.42	
Less: 50% of recast salery added to hospital cost 173:22 265 it 265 it 265 it 265 it 275 it Inspection Fees Random Fees 200000 1,25 407 65 203 83 203 83 Annual Day Exp. Random Fees 200000 1,25 1,75 1,75 Annual Day Exp. 11280 1,280 5,00 7,00 7,00 Annual Day Exp. 11280 1,158 1,175 213 Annual Day Exp. 1,1280 1,128 1,175 213 Annual Day Exp. 1,128 1,175 1,175 21 Annual Day Exp. 21300 5,00 1,000 20 20 Enrorment Fees 1,000 2,100 1,000 1,000 21 Subscription Exp. 1,16,00 1,000 1,000 21 21 Conference Exp. 2,133 213200 1,16,00 1,000 21 Subscription Exp. 2,010 1,16,00 1,16,00 20 21 Conference Exp. 2,010 2,133 21 21 21 Construct Education 2,000 2,133 21 21 21 Cost Addition Exp. 2,010 2,133 21 <td< td=""><td></td><td>LCCS . TO /0 UI SAIAI & CUSI (REIEL NOIE 1.)</td><td>11880/13</td><td></td><td>128.82</td><td></td><td>190.26</td><td>271.77</td><td></td></td<>		LCCS . TO /0 UI SAIAI & CUSI (REIEL NOIE 1.)	11880/13		128.82		190.26	271.77	
uess: 50% of recast stary added to hospital cost 8915035 8115035 86161 96.61 96.61 96.61 142.66 20333 203 Inspection Fees Reschen Fees 200000 1.25 1.75 1.75 1.75 Annual Day & Cultural Day Exp. 112800 1.255 1.75 1.75 1.75 Conference Exp. 200000 5.00 5.00 7.00 2.00 Teachers Training & Fromotion 27330 4.61900 1.000 1.000 2.00 University Affiliation Fees 1.12800 1.000 1.000 1.000 2.00 University Affiliation Fees 1.000 2.133 1.000 1.000 2.00 University Affiliation Fees 1.175 1.132 1.132 2.1 2.1 University Affiliation Fees 1.000 2.000 2.00 2.00 2.00 University Affiliation Fees 1.156 1.135 1.135 2.1 2.1 University Affiliation Fees 1.000 2.000 2.000 2.000 2.00 Odd Direct Education 2.1 2.132 2.1 2.1 2.1 Ost of the salary cost is evoluted tion the college and they are full time pracising docotes 4.00 2.000			17830069		193.22		285.38	407.65	
Inspection Fees 82266 82266 1.25 1.75 MCI inspection fees Amail Day Exp. 1.25 1.75 Amail Day Exp. Amail Day Exp. 1.25 1.75 Amail Day Exp. Amail Day Exp. 1.000 4.00 Amail Day Exp. Amail Day Exp. 1.000 4.00 Conference Exp. 200000 5.00 4.61900 1.000 4.00 Subscription Exp. 245043 4.61900 1.000 4.00 4.00 2.00000 2.00 Subscription Exp. 2411640 2.317.28 3.713 3.713 3.713 3.700 3.700 Subscription Exp. 116.00 1.000 1.000 1.000 1.000 2.11 1.75 1.25 2.15 Subscription Exp. 1.000 2.4607.40 2.477.83 8.71.25 3.700 3.000 3.000 3.000 3.000 2.000 2.000 2.000 2.000 2.000 2.000 2.000 2.000 2.000 2.000 2.000 <td< td=""><td></td><td>Less : 50% of recast salary added to hospital cost</td><td>8915035</td><td>8915035</td><td>96.61</td><td>96.61</td><td></td><td>203.83</td><td>203.83</td></td<>		Less : 50% of recast salary added to hospital cost	8915035	8915035	96.61	96.61		203.83	203.83
Micl Inspection fees 200000 125 175 175 Annual Day & Cutural Day Exp 7000 126 175 175 Annual Day & Cutural Day Exp 7000 5.00 7.00 7.00 Conference Exp 7.00 5.00 7.00 7.00 7.00 Conference Exp 20100 7.15 4.00 7.00 7.00 2.33 Conference Exp 20101 2730 4.00 4.00 4.00 4.00 4.00 4.00 2.33		Inspection Fees		00000					
Amount importence 125 175 Amount inspection 1286 12380 125 Conference Exp. 5000 500 700 Experiment frees 1000 1000 1000 Experiment frees 116.86 1000 1000 Unversity Affiliation 9725220 116.86 1000 Unversity Affiliation 1000 1000 1000 Unversity Affiliation 116.86 1170.44 21 State of the cost 9725220 116.86 170.44 21 State of the cost 8341242 137 29 11 State of the common cost 2460744 317.26 147.06 12 No of students 2460744 317.26 147.06 149 No of students 2460744 317.26 147.06 149 No of students 2000.06 200.00 200.06 147.06 No of students 2000.06 200.00 200.00 200.00 No of students 2000.06 200.00 200.00 200.00 No of students 200.06 200.00 200.00 200.00 No of students 200.06 200.00 200.00 200.00 No o		MCI Inspection food		00770					C. C. C.
Annual Usy & Cultural Day Exe. 1.75 1.75 Frontment less 50000 5.00 7.00 Conference Exp 50000 5.00 7.00 Subscription Exp 27330 461500 116.66 170.44 23 University Affiniation Fees 461500 116.66 170.44 23 University Affiniation Fees 2461004 137.29 175.44 23 Onlinear Education Cost 2461044 387.128 87.13 170.44 23 Strip Solvs & periodicals 2400744 34.128 37.128 47.788 47.00 Solvs of Adj. Common cost 2460744 34.128 37.128 47.788 47.78 Solvs of Adj. Common cost 2460744 34.128 37.128 47.78 47.78 Solvs of Adj. Common cost 2460744 34.128 37.128 47.78 47.78 47.78 Solvs of the college is not actuality within the college and they are full time practising doctors 1.15 1.45 47.88 57.00 Cost per student 200.00 200.00 200.00 300.00 1.65 50.00 1				200000					
Conference 13280 5000 700 Teachers Training & Promotion 5000 700 700 Teachers Training & Promotion 2733 66100 700 Ubscription Fees 1000 1500 1400 23 Ubscription Fees 9735220 116.86 170.00 1400 23 Ubscription Fees 9735220 116.86 173.51 23 23 S0% of Adj. Medicare cost 83.41242 87.13 97.35 24 23 S0% of Adj. Common cost 137.29 173.51 12 23 S0% of Adj. Common cost 137.29 173.51 12 24 S0% of Adj. Common cost 137.29 173.51 23 24 S0% of Adj. Common cost 246074 23 246074 1.55 1.55 24 Total Direct Education 200 cost per student 1.55 1.55 1.55 20 20 Cost per student 1.55 1.55 1.55 1.55 1.55 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 <td></td> <td>Annual Day & Cultural Day Exp.</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>1.25</td> <td>1.75</td> <td></td> <td>2.25</td>		Annual Day & Cultural Day Exp.				1.25	1.75		2.25
Conference Exp. Conference Exp. Conference Exp. Subscription Exp. Soloon 5 00 7 00 Subscription Exp. Soloon 4 00 4 00 Subscription Exp. University Affiliation Frees 116.86 170.44 University Affiliation Frees 116.86 170.44 2 University Affiliation Frees 116.86 170.44 2 University Affiliation Frees 116.86 170.44 2 Solo of Adj. Common cost 65403242 8341242 1175.41 2 Solo of Adj. Common cost 5.00 24607404 341.25 477.85 Solo of Adj. Common cost 24607404 341.26 300.00 No of stored 200.016 200.01 300.00 No of stored 200.016 200.01 300.00 Average for 2005-06 to 2007-08 1.55 1.55 Average fo		Enrolment fees		13280					
Teaches Training & Promotion 5,00 7,00 Subscription Expo Unversity Affiliaton Fees 4,00 4,00 4,00 Ubrary Books & periodicals 9735220 116,86 4,00 Unversity Affiliaton Fees 10,000 10,000 10,000 10,000 Total Direct Education Cost 9735220 116,86 170,44 2 50% of Adj. Common cost 654,0943 8713 8713 4718 4716 50% of Adj. Common cost 0.00 7000 97351 2 24674 2713 170.44 2 50% of Adj. Common cost 0.01 246074 246074 3713 47183 47183 47183 100 cost for students 0.05 the student 246074 1.77 1.70 1.90 47183 No of students 0.6 students 246074 1.77 1.70 1.90 47183 No of students 0.6 students 200.00 200.00 30100 30103 47183 47183 47183 47183 47164 47164 47164 47164 47164 47164 47164 47164 4716		Conference Exp.		50000					
Subscription Exp. 2730 2730 4 00 4 00 4 00 Unversity Affiliation Fees Library Books & pendicals 4 00 4 00 4 00 Library Books & pendicals Expendicals 9725220 116.86 4 00 150.60 Total Direct Education Cost 9735220 116.86 170.44 2 2 50% of Adj. Common cost 65004343 8341242 137.29 4778.83 2 4778.83 2 50% of Adj. Common cost 0.00 students 2.66074343 347.18 173.51 4 2 50% of the outcation 0.0 students 2.66074343 347.18 173.81 4 4 2 704 cost of education 0.0 students 2.660743 347.18 473.88 3 4 3 2 4 4 3 1 4 4 3 3 1 4 4 3 6 7 4 4 3 4 4 8 4 3 4 3 4 4 6 6 6 6 6 6 6		Teachers Training & Promotion				5.00	7 00		00.0
University Affiliation FeesUniversity Affiliation Fees4.004.004.001.0001		Subscription Exp.		2730			22.1		00.0
Library Books & periodicals461909 10.0010.00 972522010.00 170.4415.00 		University Affiliation Fees				4 00			00 1
Total Direct Education Cost9725220116.86170.44250% of Adj. Medicare cost83.4124283.41242137.29137.29173.51250% of Adj. Medicare cost83.4124287.13137.29173.512250% of Adj. Medicare cost6.674094387.13247.83103.88103.882250% of Adj. of Students2.607.092.607.002.607.003.00.003.00.00222No of students0.06 students2.607.491.711.491.4422221.551.432Average for 2005-06 to 2007-081.551.551.551.551.46222 <td< td=""><td>0</td><td>Library Books & periodicals</td><td></td><td>461909</td><td></td><td>10.00</td><td>15.00</td><td></td><td>00.4</td></td<>	0	Library Books & periodicals		461909		10.00	15.00		00.4
50% of Adj Medicare cost50% of Adj Medicare cost50% of Adj Medicare cost50% of Adj Tomon cost137.29173.5150% of Adj Common cost6540943837.13137.29173.51700 of students2460744341.28447.83No. of students2460741.771.49No. of students2460741.771.49Average for 2005-06 to 2007-081.551.46Average for 2005-06 to 2007-081.551.49Average for 2005-06 to 2007-081.551.46Average for 2005-06 to 2007-081.551.55Average for 2005-06 to 2007-081.551.		Total Direct Education Cost		972522D		116 86	00.0- 1 0 0 1 1		00.02
50% of Adj. Medicare cost8341242137.29137.29173.5150% of Adj. Common cost654094387.13103.88Total cost of education341.2887.13103.88No. of students2460740200.00300.00No. of student24607402460740300.00No. of students1.171.491.47.83No. of students1.171.491.47.83No. of students1.171.491.47.83No of the stale1.171.491.47Average for 2005-06 to 2007-081.171.49Average for 2005-06 to 2007-081.1		Comparison of the second s		0440410		00.01	110.44		202.00
50% of Adj. Common cost 50% of Adj. Common cost 50% of Adj. Common cost 103.88 Total cost of education 24607404 341.28 471.83 No. of students 200.00 300.00 300.00 Cost per student 24607404 1.71 1.49 No. of students 200000 300.00 Cost per student 200000 300.00 Average for 2005-06 to 2007-08 1.74 1.49 Average for 2005-06 to 2007-08 1.55 1.43 Average for 2005-06 to 2007-08 1.55 1.46 Average for 2005-06 to 2007-08 1.66 1.66 Average for 2005-06 to 2007-08 1.66 1.66 Average for 2005-06 to 2007-08 1.55 1.49 Average for 2005-06 to 2007-08 1.66 1.66 Average for the staff shown by the college is not actually working with the college and they are full time practising doctors 1.66	1	50% of Adi. Medicare cost		CNC1742		00 201	170 61		
Total cost of education004004001130114 </td <td>0</td> <td>50% of Adi Common cost</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>07.101</td> <td>10.071</td> <td></td> <td>67.112</td>	0	50% of Adi Common cost				07.101	10.071		67.112
Not of students 240/1404 341/28 447/83 Not of students 300.00 300.00 300.00 Cost per student 1.71 1.49 1.71 1.49 Average for 2005-06 to 2007-08 200.00 300.00 300.00 Average for 2005-06 to 2007-08 1.71 1.49 1.71 1.49 Average for 2005-06 to 2007-08 not tote by various representations by the students & parents 300.00 300.00 40% of the salary cost is excluded since it has come to our notice by various representations by the students & parents 41/46 1.49 that most of the staff shown by the college is not actually working with the college and they are full time practising doctors 1.40 and not full time faculties as declared by the management. 50% of net salary as adjusted on account of the above reason is allocated to Hospital Cost as explained in the order. 0.150% of the hospital cost considered as attributable to education cost as explained in the order. coll 50% of the hospital cost considered as attributable to education cost as explained in the order. 0.40 Expenses directly incurred towards the treatment of patients are excluded from the cost as not being related to education. 0.40		Total cost of adjunction		0040040		01.10	103.88		120.80
No. of states students 100 200.00 40 Cost per students 1.17 1.49 1.49 Acrage for 2005-06 to 2007-08 300.00 40 40% of the salary cost is excluded since it has come to our notice by various representations by the students & parents 1.49 1.49 40% of the staff shown by the college is not actually working with the college and they are full time practising doctors 1.49 40 50% of net staff shown by the college is not actually working with the college and they are full time practising doctors 50% of net staff shown by the college is not actually working with the college and they are full time practising doctors 40 50% of net salary as adjusted on account of the above reason is allocated to Hospital Cost as explained in the order. 0.150% of the hospital cost considered as attributable to education cost as explained in the order. 1.55 Expenses directly incurred towards the treatment of patients are excluded from the cost as not being related to education. 50% 60%				2400/404		341.28	441.83		577.16
Clost per student 246074 1.71 1.49 Average for 2005-06 to 2007-08 1.55 1.49 Average for 2005-06 to 2007-08 1.55 1.49 After most of the salary cost is excluded since it has come to our notice by various representations by the students & parents that most of the staff shown by the college is not actually working with the college and they are full time practising doctors 1.49 50% of net salary as adjusted on account of the above reason is allocated to Hospital Cost as explained in the order. 0.01 50% of the hospital cost considered as attributable to education cost as explained in the order. Expenses directly incurred towards the treatment of patients are excluded from the cost as not being related to education.				100		200.00	300.00		400.00
Average for 2005-06 to 2007-081.5540% of the salary cost is excluded since it has come to our notice by various representations by the students & parents40% of the staff shown by the college is not actually working with the college and they are full time practising doctorsand not full time faculties as declared by the management.50% of net salary as adjusted on account of the above reason is allocated to Hospital Cost as explained in the order.only 50% of the hospital cost considered as attributable to education cost as explained in the order.Expenses directly incurred towards the treatment of patients are excluded from the cost as not being related to education.		Cost per student		246074		1.71	1.49		1.44
		Average for 2005-06 to 2007-08				1.55			
 40% of the salary cost is excluded since it has come to our notice by various representations by the students & parents that most of the staff shown by the college is not actually working with the college and they are full time practising doctors and not full time faculties as declared by the management. 50% of net salary as adjusted on account of the above reason is allocated to Hospital Cost as explained in the order. only 50% of the hospital cost considered as attributable to education cost as explained in the order. Expenses directly incurred towards the treatment of patients are excluded from the cost as not being related to education. 	otes:								
 For the staff shown by the college is not actually working with the college and they are full time practising doctors and not full time faculties as declared by the management. 50% of net salary as adjusted on account of the above reason is allocated to Hospital. Cost as explained in the order. only 50% of the hospital cost considered as attributable to education cost as explained in the order. Expenses directly incurred towards the treatment of patients are excluded from the cost as not being related to education. 		10% of the colory and is available aimed the second to	-						
and not full time faculties as declared by the management. 50% of net salary as adjusted on account of the above reason is allocated to Hospital Cost as explained in the order. only 50% of the hospital cost considered as attributable to education cost as explained in the order Expenses directly incurred towards the treatment of patients are excluded from the cost as not being related to education.		that most of the staff shown by the colloco is not correlia	ur notice by vario	us represent	ations by the	students & p	Jarents		
SC O		and not full time faculties as declared by the management	working with the	college and t	ney are tull ti	me practising	g doctors		
e e			ſ						
O O		50% of net salary as adjusted on account of the above res	ason is allocated	d to Hospital	Cost as expl	ained in the o	order		
O O									
Expenses directly incurred towards the treatment of patients are excluded from the cost as not being related to education.		only 50% of the hospital cost considered as attributable to		as explained	in the order				
expenses uncerty incurred towards the treatment or patients are excluded from the cost as not being related to education.		Evnances directly incurred tourists the treatment of series							
		באריויזכט מווכטון וווטמווכט וטאמוטא וווכ ווכמווובוו טו אמופר	TIS are excluded	Irom the cos	t as not being	g related to e	aucation.		

Rate applied Denreciation Rate as nor Danzociation on Discourse

Recast Depreciation

?

NESAK SAL MEDICAL COLLEGE, AHMEDABAD	0				
MEDICARE COST					
	2004-05	55	2005-06	2006-07	
Sr. No. Particulars	Amount	Amount	Amount Amo	2	2007-08
Diract over the second	Rs	Rs	Alliount Amount	Amount Amount	Amount Amount
of patients		2		Rs. In lacs	
Consilmables					
Hosnital Eve	29059				
Holisakaaning Fun	97499				
l enin Evn	981235				
Pathology Consumption	142337				
Surviced Consumables	405009				
	114712				
	461589				
Mitchen & Canteen Exp.	1516800				
Pathology Chemicals	565020				
Laundry Exp.	670000				
Dental Materials	42318				
Medicine Purchased	142001				
Total	143604				
Less : To be excluded from cost	4514434				
being directly incurred for the	4514434	0	52.39	60 01	
treatment of patients				20.24	65.49
Nursing & Paramedical Staff Salary 25% Pollution Control & Incinerator Charges Depreciation on Hospital Building		100000	24.95	26.75	28.45
		9069221	12.26	12.26	12.26
ou% of recast salary exp. considered as Hospital exp.		8915035	96.61	142.69	203 83
50% of recast common cost					
	Total 1	6540943 16682483	87.13 274.58	103.88	120.80
				70.110	434.58

140.60

		AHMEDABAD						2007-08	
	MED	ICAL COLLEGE, AHMEDABAD			2005-06	2006	-07	ount Rs.	
ESAR SI	AL WILL		2004	-05	2005-00	Amount	N3.	Ouni	1
			Amount	Rs. Amo	ount Rs.	(In la	(CS)	35.00	1
COMMON	1000.			-	25.00	3	0.00		
	Particu	lars	79	064	20.00			6.00	
Sr no.			79	3773	2.00		4.00	7.50	7
	Admin	istrative Charges		5511	2.50		5.00		
1 2			1 1	0209	L		0.00	4.00	-
3	Buildi	ng Repairing Exp.		3800	2.2	5	3.00		1
4	Furni	ture/Equipment		3286					7
5	Gard	ening Exp. age & Telegram Exp	1 2	95572			40.00	50.00	
6	Post	age & Telegicin		64100 317692	30.	00	40.00	Sector States	7
7		onery Printing	2:	12030		adament.	-ROSCE - ST		
8	Cor	sulting charges ctric Burning & Other Exp. ctric Burning Entertainment & celebration		12500				the second s	
9	Ele	ctric Burning & Other Exp. uguration, Entertainment & celebration		53775					
1 10	o Ina	use Rent Exp.		33617				12.00	
1	1 1HO	use nem en en		256619			10.00	12.00	
		scellaneous Exp. epairs & Maintenance Exp.		691070		8.00	CAL DES ST	8 62 C	
	10	anitary Exp.		181253					
	A COMPANY -	ecurity Exp.		159376				Server - The Server	
		-laphone EXP.		68245					
	16 T	ravelling Exp. /ehicle & Rep. Exp.(Ambulance. Van)		29400				99.00	
	17	Jehicle & Rep. Exp. (Ambulance)		23240		89.00	94.00	5.60	
		Podistration one o		844896	7	2.00	3.75	4.00	
	00 1	Office Exp. (Norking note)				2.00	3.00	10.00	
1	20	Depreciation(Refer Working Refreshment & Recreation Exp.				6.00	8.00	6.50	
1	21 22	Defrachillenica		28398	31	4.50	5.50	2.00	
	23	Invater Charges				1.00	1.50	241.60	in the
1	23	Advertisement				174.25	207.75		
	25	Gymkhana including depresenters Maintenance of Doctors quarters		131530	80				and the
	26	Maintenance or be							
	20		(ata)	71	195		207.7	241.60	
		Less: Depreciation (As per working r	1010)		005	174.25	207.1	1	
	-	Less: Depreciation (13081	885				
	-	Recast Common Cost			-+-				
		Recast Comme						1.00	Difference
		Ling Note					Rate as p		Dille
		Working Note 2004-05			nlied De	epreciation by colleg	- I - Lin		
				Rate ap	ollege	by colleg	e guiden	5% 22084	147
		Recast Depreciation		byc	Siles	176498	171	5%	
	-	Recuest		-		3680	201	15%	1 504
	1	Building (Medical College)		1		655036 968	09	25% 8377772	711
	1	Building (Medical Chine Air Condition Machine Furniture & equipments & installa	tions	-		84489	67	00111	
1.1.1.1	1-	Eurniture & equipment							
		Computers Total Depreciation @ 15% on WDV a		_	1	during	2004-05		
a survey of	-	Total		1 & 100%	on addit	ions during	<u>j 201</u>		
	-	INDV a	s on 1-4-200	4 0 10-					